

## Music Teaching in Brazilian Schools: Arguments Towards Ethos Formation

Claudia Helena Azevedo Alvarenga  
(Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro-RJ)

Tarso Bonilha Mazzotti  
(Universidade Estácio de Sá, Rio de Janeiro-RJ)

**Abstract:** This article analyzes arguments that music has the power to transform people in that it is relevant to an individual's development and education. To this end, we compare the propositions on music by the ancient Greeks to the justifications in 2008 that defend music as a compulsory content in Brazilian schools. Rhetorical analysis from the perspective of argumentation theory was used to examine the discourse since argumentative schemes allow us to identify the values of groups. The conclusion establishes that *loci* of quality ground the premises of arguments in general and are based on epideictic rhetoric by strengthening adherence to the values proclaimed.

**Keywords:** Music Education; transformative power of music; rhetoric and argumentation.

### O ensino de música nas escolas brasileiras: argumentos acerca da formação do *ethos*

**Resumo:** Este artigo analisa os argumentos que afirmam que a música tem o poder de transformar as pessoas, de modo que seja relevante para a formação e a educação da pessoa. Para tanto, comparamos as proposições acerca da música sustentada pelos gregos na Antiguidade com as justificativas que defendem o conteúdo de música obrigatório nas escolas brasileiras em 2008. A análise retórica pelo viés da Teoria da Argumentação foi o método adotado para examinar os discursos, uma vez que os esquemas argumentativos permitem identificar os valores que os grupos sustentam. A conclusão estabelece que os lugares da qualidade fundamentam as premissas dos argumentos em geral, que se apoiam na retórica epidítica ao fortalecer a adesão aos valores que proclama.

**Palavras-chave:** Educação Musical. Poder transformador da música. Retórica e argumentação.

Throughout Brazil, art (music) education is a core curricular component of the Basic Education.<sup>1</sup> Its objective is the cultural development of students, as it is desirable that they “become sensitive listeners, talented amateurs or professional musicians”<sup>2</sup> as described by the National Curriculum Parameters of Arts in Basic Education (BRAZIL, 1997: 54, our translation). In some way, the discourse aims to guarantee the teaching of music in schools, which was made compulsory by the passing of Law 11769 in 2008. In 2016 it was extended to drama, dance and visual arts as set forth by Law 13278.

Going back to a more remote context, music was a relevant subject in the education and growth of citizens of ancient Greece, belonging to the field of advanced studies of the *Quadrivium*, along with arithmetic, geometry and astronomy. It is plausible to assume that notions of what is sensitive and talented, like *ethos* or the internal attributes that training in music can develop in people, have different meanings in contexts mentioned above. Since the nineteenth century, the concept of a talented musician by Western European society encompasses notions of the artist's genius. To the Greeks, the talented musician is understood as the virtuoso; not exactly from the perspective of technical mastery of an instrument, but especially in striving for a harmonious nature (*ethos*) (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 26. PEREIRA, 1996: 124-126).

By analysing music representations rooted in common sense, it is observed that the meaning of words can vary not only among different social groups, but also over time for the same group. Although the situations briefly presented between present-day Brazilians and ancient Greeks are from a perspective not only culturally distinct, but distant in time, there is a more enduring common argument that upholds that music knowledge changes and transforms people. Transforming individuals broadly fits the purpose of education. In some way, all areas of knowledge embrace this purpose. It implies, among other faculties, in leading individuals from a less educated state to a more educated one, which is characteristic to any learning process and universal to human nature as we are all capable of learning (REBOUL, 2000: 20-22). The possibility of modifying cognitive and affective conditions is a postulate of education as we experience it in our learning process. However, it remains to understand the meaning of persuasive arguments as to the relevance of music as a subject to be taught in schools.

The argument as to what defines music and its function exposes representations of music and its teaching. Negotiation of these meanings is conducted through communication practices (language). To understand the meaning of a discourse, situating the social context is necessary. It is the social situation that rules the enunciation and conditions of the argumentative schemes of the discourse. The affirmation of an individual's position is strongly related to his/her group belonging (ingroups), and it is possible to expose the representations held by groups through a rhetorical analysis of their discourse.

Rhetorical analysis was proposed by Aristotle and amplified by the New Rhetoric movement in the mid-twentieth century led by Chaïm Perelman and Lucie Olbrechts-Tyteca who sought to rationalize value judgements. It allows us to identify what is considered desirable — in this case, why we teach music at school and what is said to be educational in music teaching — as established by a hierarchy of values that defines what is considered preferable. The analysis of

---

<sup>1</sup> The Basic Education in Brazil comprises pre-school, primary (or elementary) and secondary education, equivalent to K-12 education system.

<sup>2</sup> “[...] que os alunos se tornem ouvintes sensíveis, amadores talentosos ou músicos profissionais” (BRAZIL, 1997: 54).

argumentative structures of discourses expressing thoughts and beliefs is a method, or path to knowing the meanings attributed to music and the value it has in the education of individuals.

As an object of initial theoretical investigation, we expose the reasoning that supports the possibility of forming spirit (*ethos*) through music. For this, we present an analysis of the contributions of music education considered preferable that are exposed in two different situations: (1) in classical antiquity through the concept of *mousiké* and the refutation of Sextus Empiricus on music as a discipline for learning; and (2) in the current Brazilian social context, taking into account the debate that resulted in the adoption of Law 11769/2008 that made music compulsory in schools.

In any case, could one approach the concept of *mousiké* from the pre-Socratic period and the refutations of Empiricus conceived between the second and third centuries AD and then bring them together in the context of Brazilian music education without creating an anachronism? As already mentioned, our question revolves around understanding the long-standing arguments that hold music as being relevant to education as an enabler of transformation. Here we might suggest that there are argumentative schemes that cross over time and historical periods. It is not about comparing and simulating two distinct time periods, but of pointing out that certain issues endure as we recover arguments that remain valuable. Anachronism would require Empiricus to argue like our contemporaries.

Analyzing the values assigned to music and its teaching means asking why it is worth teaching music at school. Thus, we return to the issues that remain in education, as well as the refutations on the subject, in order to grasp the plurality of its meanings.

### **Music - the concept of *mousiké***

To describe the meanings of music in Greek thought is a task that goes beyond the proposal of this article, but it is feasible to present a sketch showing that Greek notions of music was not restricted to the production of sound or the mastery of technique (art) on an instrument or voice. Nor did it embrace the notion of musical theory associated to the writing and reading of music as currently conceived.

Through etymology, music and *mousa* (muse) have the same root. Muses were goddesses that led to inspiration and knowledge; also meaning vocal singing and the persuasive word. According to Tomás (2002: 39-40), another possible interpretation approximates the words *mousa* and *manthanein* (to learn, study, instruct, memorize, discern, understand) whose root is the same for the word “mathematics”, understood as “to learn scientifically”. Music was one of the seven branches of the Greek educational curriculum. Three means of knowledge of a linguistics aspect comprise the *Trivium*: rhetoric, grammar and logic. Music integrated the scientific studies of the *Quadrivium* along with arithmetic, geometry and astronomy. Music was the application of number theory that defined arithmetic (JOSEPH, 2002: 3). In addition, music was intertwined with other aspects of Greek life in which the concept of *mousiké* was linked to the word, poetry, mathematical thinking (proportion) and number theory, i.e., as the organizing principle of the world (REBOUL, 2000: 29. TOMÁS, 2002: 51-52). Thus, in the Greek conception, there was a notion of practical music and theoretical music, where theoretical music was conceived as an

intellectual skill, not necessarily a sonorous skill; in other words, a theorization of language which is philosophical in nature. Lohmann (1989 apud TOMÁS, 2002: 52, our translation)<sup>3</sup> clarifies that

[...] the concept of *mousiké* was understood as a kind of abstract-matrix-logical entity, since it did not depend on any previous presupposition and it was originated from all concepts by containing within itself a coherent articulation apt to systematize different domains, such as music as a sound phenomenon, numbers, alphabet letters, speech logic, among others.

This definition exposes the comprehensiveness of the notion of music (*mousiké*) including it in the metaphysical and philosophical debate. The discussions on music that epitomize the myth of Orpheus usually emphasize its magical and divine character. In other situations, the function of music education is highlighted as it influences the spirit and awakens emotions or memories through the diverse compositions of tones and melodies according to how they are used. Here we observe a more concrete disposition for music as a sound phenomenon that places it in a particular ambience, where the belief that music modifies the soul or spirit prevails. Consequently, it is possible to educate through music, to form the character or *ethos* through music education.

In more general circumstances, the Greek conception of music also encompasses the concepts of harmony, cosmos and *logos*, as organizers of thought and “acquires a cognitive character that enables a logical construct of the world” (TOMÁS, 2002: 110, our translation).<sup>4</sup> The comprehension of “cosmos” refers to the notion of order and measure. “Harmony”, in its origin, means “unification of opposites or conflicting elements ordered in a whole” (TOMÁS, 2002: 97, our translation),<sup>5</sup> that is, an adjustment as in a fitting of different or opposite pieces that harmonize together. Between 600 and 300 BC, these beliefs coexisted in an interdependent and complementary manner, and they forged the concept of *mousiké* as being connected to the notion of *logos* as a unified totality.

This conception has not always been sustained in the same way among the Greeks, since rhetoric and mathematics, as well as other branches of knowledge, such as philosophy, questioned some of these principles. However, these representations became mainly impregnated in the common sense at that time. They constituted the set of socially accepted opinions (*doxa*), that is, the beliefs shared by most people on the value of music, largely propagated by Pythagoras’ ideas and by Plato’s conceptions. What did Pythagorean philosophy propose?

Tomás (2002: 85-106) explains that information about Pythagoras and his production is controversial, since there is no actual document written by him; all sources are secondary. He founded a group of a philosophical and religious nature whose teachings were kept secret. The accounts treat him as a thinker who combined the qualities of sage, seer, mathematician, poet, religious leader, among others. Within the Pythagorean perspective, knowledge is based on an integrated relationship among numbers, music and harmony. The conception of harmony was

<sup>3</sup> “[...] o conceito de *mousiké* era compreendido como um tipo de entidade abstrato-matrical-lógica, pois não dependia de nenhum pressuposto anterior e era originária de todos os conceitos por conter em si uma articulação coerente apta a sistematizar diferentes domínios, sejam eles música como fenômeno sonoro, números, letras do alfabeto, lógica do discurso, entre outros” (LOHMANN, 1989 apud TOMÁS, 2002: 52).

<sup>4</sup> “[...] adquire um caráter cognitivo que possibilita um constructo lógico do mundo” (TOMÁS, 2002: 110).

<sup>5</sup> “[...] unificação dos contrários ou elementos conflituosos ordenados em um todo” (TOMÁS, 2002: 97).

based on the theory of numbers as an organizing support and it was also grounded on the belief that all things had an immutable essence ruled by numerical proportion relations.

Knowledge of all things was possible because their essences (numbers / proportions) harmonized amongst each other. Things are numbers and numbers are things, that is, they are figures. They are not abstract arithmetic sums: one (1) is the point; two (2) is the line; three (3) is the triangle; four (4) is the square. The tetrad whose sum is 10 (composed by the sum of the first 4 natural numbers  $1 + 2 + 3 + 4$ ) was considered sacred and perfect because it generates the number ten (10) that permits forming the other numbers. Pythagoras also studied the division of string length. By dividing the string in half ( $1/2$ ) we generate the octave. Then, there follows the fifth and the fourth intervals corresponding respectively to the division of the string into  $2/3$  and  $3/4$ , in the sequence based on the use of tetrad whose multiplication ( $2/3 \times 3/4$ ) results in the octave ( $1/2$ ). Therefore, sounds are numbers too.

Thus, music is the harmony of cosmos or harmony of spheres (of measures, of proportions) or music of the spheres (harmony = music), so that the Pythagoreans sought to relate the harmonic proportions in macro and microcosmic compositions. This representation of music deals with the “silent” music as a philosophical and metaphysical subject, it has no direct implication in musical performance.

Besides the numerical attributes and mathematical relations (proportion), the value of music was considered based on how it mobilized the individual's inner feelings, operating a moral conduct (*ethos*), “its ability to restrain passions and lead to virtue” (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 20), that is, the harmonious (musical) nature in the sense of *mousiké*. Within the Greek cultural perspective, the study of tonalities and modes appropriate to certain states of mind was relevant to society, and referred to the ontological character of music for educational purposes, that is, for *ethos* formation. This representation of music among the ancient Greeks crossed the centuries. It was one of the points challenged by sceptic philosophy which considered both philosophers' opinions and common sense to make a rebuttal argument.

To sum up the above, Pereira (1996) highlights five propositions that form the Greek *doxa* on music (*mousiké*): (1) philosophy and music are composed by the same elements, as both move the soul towards maturity by establishing limits to pleasure; (2) the cosmos is organized under harmonic principles, hence, musical assumptions; (3) to achieve the best of their ethical training and become a virtuoso, people must be musically trained as early as possible, since the musician and the virtuoso have a harmonious spirit; (4) musically educated people take more pleasure in listening to music than those who are not; (5) certain melodies provoke certain states of psychism, they form the *ethos*.

In the analyses of prevailing philosophical thought in ancient Greece exposed by Empiricus (1986) and Pereira (1996), music appears as a primordial element. Music is said to be the essence of the world, since the universe is organized under its principles. Thus, *mousiké* is not the result of philosophical elaboration carried out by men, but an energy that creates and organizes the universe, thus, prior to human existence and to which men are submitted. These considerations also attribute a magical force to music, which affects everyone, since melodies modify and affect human emotions, influence and modify the psyche. So, music (*mousa*) seduces and persuades, as much as poetry and the word.

Music training in its own way gives access to virtue, transforming the person through a kind of resonating movement with a sonority that expresses a certain *ethos*. Thus, music in itself is enough, since the proper mode for instituting different states of mind are absolute — the same for all humans and with the same effect on all individuals — that is, seeking the establishment of universal *ethoi*. The arguments already exposed also indicate that musically educated people experience a unique sensation: they take greater delight at listening to music and become more virtuous than others. This reasoning separates individuals into virtuous and non-virtuous, where the former is the desired quality.

### **The values and the reasoning supporting them**

Perelman and Olbrechts-Tyteca (1971: 83-93) comment that people choose more general categories of arguments as a starting point (premises) to support values and to affirm what is supposed to be preferable. These are the most common premises that constitute the common places termed as *loci* (*topoi* for the Greeks) of argumentation. They present the initial objects of agreement between interlocutors, which can be accessed with certain convenience to persuade. For each presented *loci*, it is possible to refute them with their opposites. For instance, *loci* of quantity affirming hierarchy of the greatest number over the minor or the whole over the part, can be opposed to *loci* of quality which present what is rare and unique as preferable.

According to Empiricus's refutations, it is feasible to suggest that beliefs about music in Greek thought are anchored on *loci* of quality for they value unusual and original qualities, which are precious because of their precariousness. Thus, the philosopher and the musician are special in comparison to common beings because their distinguished abilities towards virtue bring them closer to the gods, as in the myth of Orpheus whose ability with the lyre was considered divine. Greek thoughts on music also include *loci* of order, stating superiority of principles and laws over concrete fact, as the principle organizes the world, being prior to fact. The Greeks also cite the *loci* of essence, which seek the object or person that best represents essence, in this case, the virtuous man is the one who best characterizes and embodies the harmony of the cosmos (the essence).

By presenting what kind of man is preferable, values are hierarchized by exposing the most desirable ones. Simultaneously, the notion of “man” is dissociated. The dissociation of this notion, as well as the hierarchy of values, seek to remove incompatibilities through different reasonings. In this case the notion of man is dissociated into a virtuous (Term 2) and a non-virtuous man (Term 1). Term 2 establishes a measure, the qualities that man must have which Term 1 does not hold, therefore, being inferior to Term 2. In this sense, when the dissociation is set, Term 2 defines a criterion that presents Term 1 as a deception (PERELMAN; OLBRECHTS-TYTECA, 1971: 416-417). Indeed the beliefs expose arguments considered valid for social actors. Although they are not unquestionable truths, they constitute a set of plausible opinions revealing not only what is admitted, but also what influences the action of groups that recognize them as reasonable.

In Greece, sceptics questioned the truths of these statements. Sextus Empiricus, as one of the sceptic philosophers whose origin goes back to Pyrrhonian Skepticism, presented his refutations in *Adversus musicos* (Against the Musicians) opposing the premises that founded the value of music (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 125-127. PEREIRA, 1996: 121-129). The questions are basically of two natures: (1) why do changes associated to music lead man towards virtue? (2) how to

ensure that specific melodies cause certain affects to the soul? Ranging from the philosophers' opinion to a common-sense point of view, Sextus Empiricus considers various sources to develop his reasoning. This is based on the use of opposing arguments, but with equal force, leading to an undecided situation, that is, to the suspension of judgment. "As a result of this system, one seems to stop dogmatizing" (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 17).

From Greek conceptions relating to poetry and music, Sextus Empiricus questions the first statement that music leads one to virtue. "If poetics is indeed useful for life and music seems to adorn this by arranging it into divisions and making it fit for singing, music will be needful" (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 139). Thus, in the ethical dimension, music only represents virtue because of the rational tendency of the human being to want to achieve it. By arguing that even babies and animals calm down when listening to particular songs, Empiricus also rejects the belief that those who are musically educated are fonder of music than other people. "In the same manner in which we enjoy tasting food or wine without the art of cookery and the art of wine-tasting, so also without the art of music we would enjoy listening to delightful melos" (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 153). According to Empiricus the educated only have better knowledge of the art. He also opposes himself to the assurance that anybody may become a virtuoso the sooner one begins musical training. He warns that the effect can be adverse, "rendering the young easily led into licentiousness and salaciousness" (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 153-155).

The second question is about whether the same melodies provoke the same moods in everybody. Empiricus states that it may occur in different ways for people because a melody, whether more energetic or mournful, has no relation of cause and effect on the person who appreciates it. This association of sound with emotion is a human production that relies on learned practices. "Some of the *mele* (melodies) of music are not by nature of one sort and others of another sort but are presumed so to be by us" (EMPIRICUS, 1986: 143). So, according to Empiricus "music has the power to distract or delight, but not to instil a particular *ethos*" (PEREIRA, 1996: 129, our translation).<sup>6</sup>

The conceptions of *ethos* are forged insofar as — in relating a melody to a certain character and frequently practicing this association — one creates customs which become naturalized by recurrence, that is, repetition makes them into a habit. Thus, the social construction of what is considered traditional goes unnoticed. In this sense, the educational purposes linked to *ethos* theory become evident, since it is necessary to keep the values of groups to maintain their existence. Values are taught and learned so that they can be shared among members in social groups.

Therefore, the values supported by groups are objects of agreement. Through communicative practices, social actors negotiate what they affirm and reject, establishing what they consider and recognize as valid for their ingroup. From this perspective, it is necessary that social actors often remember what is consensual. The epideictic ceremonials weave the warp of shared values to safeguard the groups' cultural identity. Festivals, celebrations and artistic shows are some examples of the epideictic oratory whose habits are reinforced in the very occurrence of these meetings (KENNEDY, 1998: 222-223). Since the transmission of values is a practice that integrates the epideictic genre, we understand that educational activities are of great relevance for

---

<sup>6</sup> "[...] a música tem o poder de educar, distrair ou provocar o deleite, mas não de instilar esse *ἦθος*" (PEREIRA, 1996: 129).

this purpose; therefore, education integrates the epideictic rhetoric, since what is usually taught is the knowledge considered most adequate to maintain the group's cohesion.

In the case of schooling, the fields, subjects and content chosen to be taught expose those that are most preferable to society. Thus, the campaign that approved music as a compulsory content in the Brazilian Basic Education curriculum in 2008 restored the debate on the value of music and its teaching to society, which will be commented below.

### **Current purpose of teaching music in Basic Education**

The law that made music a compulsory content in Brazil's Basic Education program was one of the outcomes of the debate convened by the Ministry of Culture in 2004 among music professionals to discuss a cultural policy plan for Brazilian music. The deepening of discussions between civil and parliamentary bodies led to the constitution of a bill in 2006 that was approved two years later. Thus, in 2008, Law 11769 established the compulsory nature of music as a school content (BRAZIL, 2008a), which has since been extended to drama, dance and the visual arts by Law 13278.

The documents produced throughout the process constituted the discursive *corpus* that exposed positions of adhesion and opposition to music education in school. At the same time, it brought to light the meanings of music for those involved. The rhetorical analysis of the debate allowed for the identification of the most persuasive elements in argumentation and proved to be an efficient tool to expose dissents when rival discourses emerged. The disputes present beliefs, values and their hierarchies, as well as group preferences. They evidence the argumentative schemes used to obtain adhesion which may be refuted by the audience, as previously exposed by Empiricus's counter-arguments on music linked to virtuosity and to *ethos* formation.

The rhetorical analysis of the discursive *corpus* produced during the two years of debate prior to the approval of the law allowed us to identify not only the hegemonic representations on music and its teaching, but also what the proponents described as being educational in music teaching at schools. It was also possible to understand the identity processes concerning musicalities. The values affirm romantic representations of social identity, in such a way that the predominant conception states the work of art as the result of the artist's talent. Music is conceived as the group's symbolic and immanent core. In this sense, the notion of music is linked to the idea of essence as an element that establishes bonds of social identity. Similarly, the notion of inner feelings, supported by the belief that music contacts the ineffability, reaffirms the results found by Duarte (2004: 169-174) showing that music teachers' representations of music are condensed in the metaphor "music is life" that has two biases: (1) music is food for the soul; (2) music is the path and the healing for school.

This metaphor exposes the teachers' belief in the existence of qualities inherent to music which characterizes an essentialist conception. Such representations of music have non-negotiable meanings, since they are argued in place of the sublime and the divine, beyond the human. Music's transforming potential comes from this condition which exposes reasoning's circularity. The notions of path and healing are based on the representation that only artistic subjects promote sensitivity and emotion, so music is considered precious (*loci* of quality).



As an illustration, we refer to the definition of music that appears in a book on music pedagogy by Argentine educator and pianist Violeta de Gainza (2002: 129, our translation):<sup>7</sup>

Music constitutes a unique and privileged object of special meaning for human beings. Throughout more than twenty centuries of Western history, the great thinkers of the field of knowledge, science and culture have sought to explain the tangible effects as well as the deeply mysterious essence of music.

Violeta de Gainza<sup>8</sup> has widespread leadership in teaching music all over Latin American countries, as Fonterrada (2008: 224-226) argues. The definition of music that Violeta de Gainza offers synthesizes a romantic representation of music that has strong adhesion by music educators. The romantic conception is based on what is said to be unique, original, distinctive, rare and precarious, characterizing *loci* of quality.

In our society the belief that music teaching can transform people is extended to social contexts. For instance, Guazina (2011: 301-304) analyses the effect of music practices conducted by a non-governmental organization (NGO) in violent environments like slums. It was found that the representation of social transformations was more focused on individuals rather than on the social context as a whole. The meanings of this transformation exceeded the notion of knowledge acquisition, often associated with training for work. Transformations encompassed cognitive and expressive changes in the person, as well as a social repositioning based on the person's positive image before the ingroup. However, music teaching linked to public security policy implemented by the state operated a means of social control, hampering the construction of deeper social change, in effect maintaining the *status quo* of the situation before introducing the practice of music in the community. Once again, we emphasize the predominance of the representation of music practice is of an epideictic nature, since it promotes the bonds of social identity.

This representation of music surpasses the conception of music teachers. It is also asserted by popular musicians who expound their beliefs by claiming that they themselves are in some way the expression of God (REQUIÃO, 2008: 137). Based on this reasoning, musicians and artists in general are considered special beings, distinct from others, because they embody the expression of music. The characterization of genius is another aspect that contributes to the idealization of the artist. Music intuition usually appears related to inspiration. Both have to do with the "naturalization" of learning, which erases the process of acquiring technical knowledge, simultaneously circumscribing any creative activity in music to the field of inspiration, the divine breath that "comes from within the soul". Someone's innate talent is equally associated with intuition, both considered inherent to the person, that is, latent abilities that only need to be "awakened" (SCHROEDER, 2004: 110-111).

These arguments set in *loci* of quality have strong adhesion in common sense too. The attribution of inherent and special qualities to musicians, such as genius, intuition and talent,

<sup>7</sup> "La música constituye un objeto único, privilegiado, de especial significación para el género humano. Ao largo de más de veinte siglos de historia de Occidente, los grandes pensadores del campo del conocimiento, la ciencia y la cultura han procurado explicar los efectos tangibles, así como la esencia profundamente misteriosa de la música" (GAINZA, 2002: 129).

<sup>8</sup> Available at: <<http://www.violetadegainza.com.ar>>. Accessed on: 16 Aug. 2017.

distinguishes musicians and artists in general from ordinary people. This assumption is based on beliefs and value judgments from everyday experience and points out the connection between objects / beings and their qualities. The predications attributed to music are transferred to musicians by relations of coexistence, an argument that is founded on the establishment of links between a manifestation and its essence or relating certain acts as typical of the person's expression, termed "act-person relation" by Perelman and Olbrechts-Tyteca (1971: 296-305).

The notion of genius linked to superiority, so that it is not possible to locate another source other than the person, characterizes a reasoning founded on the act-person relation. Similarly, it exposes a reasoning equivalent to the Greek conception that dissociates the notion of "man" by separating this notion into virtuoso (musicians and philosophers) and non-virtuoso. The musician's talent qualities constitute Term 2 of the dissociation by presenting the true and real musician, the predicative that Term 1 does not have.

The belief that music has an essence *a priori* which is accessed only by some peculiar people is doubtful. Only daily and continuous musical activities allow familiarization with this "language". Once the "language" becomes familiar, the acquiring process of musical abilities is somehow forgotten, since knowledge linking the phenomenon to habitual practices creates the symbolic value that attests the quality, making the situation "natural". There is nothing inherent to music that is not an expression of social relations and intersubjective character (SCHROEDER, 2006: 70). Here the authorized speaker expresses the voice of the audience and "the hearers share the speaker's respect or admiration for values extolled in an epideictic speech" (PERELMAN; OLBRECHTS-TYTECA, 1971: 451).

Turning back to the subject of music teaching at schools, we can briefly analyze another aspect of Brazilian education: the skills and abilities required from students at the end of Basic Education, which are defined by the National Exam of Upper Secondary Education (ENEM), the most pervasive exam taken at the end of Basic Education. The fourth Area of Competency in Language and Codes from the Reference Matrix for the elaboration of the ENEM expresses the predominantly identitarian character of music teaching by establishing the following competency for arts: "understand art as cultural and aesthetic knowledge that generates meaning and integrates the organization of the world and one's own identity." (BRAZIL, 2015: 66, our translation).<sup>9</sup> Once more, the purpose of *ethos* formation is evident when integrating the repertoire of group cultural traditions which affirm social belonging by the communion of values.

Finally, Law 11769/2008 was approved with a presidential veto, stating that only teachers with specific training in the area could teach music in schools. The justification for the veto was based on a statement by the Minister of Education: "It is worth mentioning that music is a social practice and that in Brazil there are several professionals working in this area without academic or official training in music and who are nationally recognized" (BRAZIL, 2008b: 3, our translation).<sup>10</sup> According to the Minister, these professionals would be prevented from working in school. The veto could be analyzed within the ambit of professional legislation. However, we are now

<sup>9</sup> "Compreender a arte como saber cultural e estético gerador de significação e integrador da organização do mundo e da própria identidade" (BRAZIL, 2015: 66).

<sup>10</sup> "Vale ressaltar que a música é uma prática social e que no Brasil existem diversos profissionais atuantes nessa área sem formação acadêmica ou oficial em música e que são reconhecidos nacionalmente" (BRAZIL, 2008b: 3).

interested in extracting opposing values that explain the functionality of music in school. The arguments supporting music teaching presented as favorable opinions and in defense of the project affirm that: (1) despite the intense presence of music in the everyday lives of students, music teaching in school is precarious in relation to other artistic languages; (2) music education develops cognitive, affective, psychomotor, and other capacities, and allows construction of personal and social values, constituting a “privileged instance of socialization” (SENADO FEDERAL, 2006: 2); (3) music is important for the development of the human being and for constituting a Brazilian national identity (SENADO FEDERAL, 2007: 2).

The analysis of the first assertion takes us back to *loci* of argumentation whose incompatibility opposes quantity to quality. How can music intensely fulfill the lives of students outside school (quantity) and, at the same time, be so precarious (quality) in school? The implicit reasoning holds that music should be omnipresent (music is life), which places it at the plane of the organizing principle of the world. Thus, a school without music is dead, and it is therefore necessary to restore the subject of music to the curricular matrix, because should it disappear from the school’s curriculum, the error would be irreparable. In this case, “the *locus* of the irreparable, when used to encourage action, gives the arguments a particularly moving character” (PERELMAN, 2004: 189, our translation).<sup>11</sup>

The second assertion likewise rests on the quality place when it affirms that music is a “privileged” instance of socialization. The privilege *status* is rare, hence music’s superiority. Still under this reasoning, music is presented as propitiating development of diverse capacities, and construction of social and personal values. We can bring together these arguments to our earlier reasoning about the usefulness of music in ancient Greece. Development of such diverse capacities (affective, cognitive, among others) that music can provide aims to improve the person by his/her insertion into culture. Although other subjects in the schooling process have the same purpose, this argument puts music at the top of this hierarchy, since music, more than other fields of knowledge, can modify the individual, making him/her civilized in his/her interactions, a refinement that brings the individual close to the notion of becoming a virtuoso. The construction of personal and social values provided by music teaching is comparable to *ethos* formation. It relates to what kind of musicality should be taught in school to develop the Brazilian citizen, the Brazilian *ethos*. In this perspective, the presidential veto, an opposition discourse, exposes the representations of the most appropriate speaker to teach music in school.

By declaring the constitution of a national identity as the purpose of music education in the schooling process, the third proposition clearly assumes music as the designer of *ethos*, personifying the Brazilian citizen. Music’s responsibility for forming character and human nature is a recurring argument, deeply rooted in culture and common sense. When Brazilian musicians are summoned as authorized speakers to teach music, to the detriment of music teachers (in reality, this is not possible by the current educational legislation), the presidential veto exposes the epideictic character of music and the educational discourse by presenting the preferable option. “True” Brazilian music (dissociation from the notion of “music”) is embodied by nationally recognized musicians (act-person relation), since music teachers may not be the best representatives of Brazilian *ethos*.

---

<sup>11</sup> “O lugar do irreparável, quando é utilizado para incentivar à ação, confere aos argumentos um caráter particularmente comovente” (PERELMAN, 2004: 189).

Thus, it is evident that what is desirable in music teaching is to form a Brazilian *ethos* whose identity bonds are reinforced by supporting the traditions shared by the Brazilian people.

## Final remarks

The contributions of music in the education of the individual considered preferable allow an exposition of values attributed to music and its teaching. We have proposed the exposition of argumentative schemes that claim music to be necessary for the education of an individual in two distinct sociocultural contexts. The objective is to present the usual argumentative techniques used by social actors to defend the values they sustain in relation to the teaching of music.

Despite such different contexts, we also highlight the distinguished meanings that affirm the power of music to transform the person, hence its relevance for education. The argumentative schemes which state that music may transform and improve individuals are cyclical. They usually rely on *loci* of quality for what music provides as rare, original and precious in connection to inner feelings and affection.

Although the belief that music has inherent qualities that produce such changes still persists, the mobilization of people actually occurs through learning, that is, through education in particular usages and customs, and by its repetition. This is characteristic of epideictic discourses that aim for the communion of values to maintain social cohesion and group identity.

Hence, the Greek *ethos* established by music on one hand, as well as musical education identified with national identity on the other hand, are a human invention materialized by social narratives guiding human actions by establishing the preferable.

## References

BRAZIL. Ministry of Education. Secretary of Elementary Education. *Parâmetros curriculares nacionais* [Parameters of national curricula]: art / Secretary of Elementary Education - Brasília: MEC/SEF, 1997. 130 pp. Available at: <<http://portal.mec.gov.br/seb/arquivos/pdf/livro06.pdf>>. Accessed on: Sept. 10, 2017.

\_\_\_\_\_. Law no. 11,769, of 18 August 2008. Alters Law no. 9,394, of 20 December 1996, Law of Guidelines and Basis of Education, to rule on the compulsory teaching of music in basic education. *Diário Oficial [da União]*, Brasília, DF, 19 August 2008, no. 159, section 1, p. 1. 2008a.

\_\_\_\_\_. Despachos do Presidente da República [Orders of the President of the Republic]. Message no. 622, 18 August 2008. *Diário Oficial [da União]*, Brasília, DF, 19 August 2008, no. 159, section 1, p. 3. 2008b. Available at:

<<http://pesquisa.in.gov.br/imprensa/jsp/visualiza/index.jsp?data=19/08/2008&jornal=1&pagina=3&totalArquivos=72>>. Accessed on: Sept. 17, 2017.

\_\_\_\_\_. Edital no. 6, 15 May 2015. Exame Nacional do Ensino Médio - Enem 2015. *Diário Oficial [da República Federativa do Brasil]*, Brasília, DF, 18 May 2015, no. 92, section 3, pp. 59-74.

DUARTE, Mônica de Almeida. *Por uma análise retórica dos sentidos do ensino de música na escola regular*. Thesis (Doctorate in Education). Graduate program in School Education, School of Education, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, 2004.

EMPIRICUS, Sextus. *Against the Musicians (Adversus Musicos)*. New critical text and translation by Denise Davidson Greaves (Greek and Latin Music Theory, ed. Thomas J. Mathiesen). Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1986.

FONTEERRADA, Marisa Trench de Oliveira. *De tramas e fios: um ensaio sobre música e educação*. 2nd ed. São Paulo: Editora UNESP; Rio de Janeiro: Funarte, 2008.

GAINZA, Violeta Hemsy de. *Pedagogía musical: dos décadas de pensamiento y acción educativa*. Buenos Aires - México: Lumen, 2002.

GUAZINA, Laize Soares. *Práticas musicais em Organizações Não Governamentais: uma etnografia sobre a (re)invenção da vida*. Thesis (Doctorate in Music). Graduate Program in Music, Center of Letters and Arts, Universidade Federal do Estado do Rio de Janeiro, 2011.

JOSEPH, S. Miriam. *The Trivium: The Liberal Arts of Logic, Grammar, and Rhetoric*. Edited by: Marguerite McGlinn. Philadelphia: Paul Dry Books, Inc., 2002.

KENNEDY, George. *A Comparative Rhetoric: An Historical and Cross-Cultural Introduction*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998.

PEREIRA, Aires Rodeia. Polêmica acerca da Mousiké no *Adversus Músicos* de Sexto Empírico. *Humanitas*, Coimbra, v. 48, p.117-140, 1996. Available at:

<[http://www.uc.pt/fluc/eclassicos/publicacoes/ficheiros/humanitas48/08\\_Rodeia\\_Pereira.pdf](http://www.uc.pt/fluc/eclassicos/publicacoes/ficheiros/humanitas48/08_Rodeia_Pereira.pdf)>. Accessed on: Aug. 21, 2017.

PERELMAN, Chaïm. *Retóricas*. Transl. Maria Ermantina de A. P. Galvão. 2nd ed. São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2004.

PERELMAN, Chaim; OLBRECHTS-TYTECA, Lucie. *A New Rhetoric: a treatise on Argumentation*. Transl. J. Wilkinson and P. Weaver. 2nd ed. Notre Dame/London, University of Dame Press, 1971.

REBOUL, Olivier. *A filosofia da educação*. Transl. Antônio Rocha e Artur Morão. Lisbon: Editions: 70, 2000.

REQUIÃO, Luciana Pires de Sá. “*Eis a Lapa...*”: Processos e Relações de Trabalho do Músico nas casas de shows da Lapa. Thesis (Doctorate in Education). Graduate Program in Education, School of Education, Universidade Federal Fluminense, 2008.

SCHROEDER, Silvia Cordeiro Nassif. O músico: desconstruindo mitos. *Revista da ABEM*, Porto Alegre, v. 10, p. 109-118, Mar. 2004.

\_\_\_\_\_. O discurso sobre música: reflexos na educação musical. *Claves*, n. 2, p. 60-75, 2006.

SENADO FEDERAL SENATE [OF BRAZIL]. *Project of Senate Bill no. 330 of 2006, 14 of December 2006*. Alters Law no. 9,394 of 1996, known as the “Diretrizes e Bases da Educação, para dispor sobre a obrigatoriedade do ensino de música na educação básica” [Guidelines and Bases for Education, to rule on the compulsory teaching of music in basic education]. Available at: <<http://legis.senado.leg.br/sdleg-getter/documento?dm=4351657&disposition=inline>>. Accessed on: Aug. 7, 2017.

SENADO FEDERAL SENATE [OF BRAZIL]. *Parecer de aprovação da relatora Senadora Marisa Serrano* [Approval statement by Senator Marisa Serrano], 4 December 2007. Available at: <<http://legis.senado.leg.br/sdleg-getter/documento?dm=4351639&disposition=inline>>. Accessed on: Aug. 7, 2017.

TOMÁS, Lia. *Ouvir o lógos: música e filosofia*. São Paulo: Editora UNESP, 2002.

.....

**Claudia Helena Azevedo Alvarenga** holds a doctorate in Education from the Universidade Estácio de Sá and a bachelor's degree in Music Composition and Teaching from the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro State (UNIRIO). She is a music teacher at the Colégio de Aplicação (Teacher's Training High School) of the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ). She is director of the Choir of the Scholem Aleichem Association (RJ) and member of the Rhetoric and Argumentation in Pedagogy research group. Her research includes reflections on music and education having published the digital book *Música, a alma do povo* [Music, the soul of the people] (2013). As a co-author with Tarso Mazzotti, she published the chapter "Eu sou o samba—Retórica e Identidade" [I am samba—Rhetoric and Identity] as part of the book *O Samba e Filosofia* [Samba and Philosophy] (2015) and recent articles entitled: "Raciocínios que instituem o valor do ensino da música na escola brasileira" [Reasonings that establish the value of teaching music in Brazilian schools] (2016) and "Análise dos argumentos que apresentam as 20 metas do Plano Nacional de Educação" [Analysis of arguments that introduce the 20 goals of the National Education Plan] (2017). [alvarengacha@gmail.com](mailto:alvarengacha@gmail.com)

**Tarso Bonilha Mazzotti** holds a Bachelor's degree in Pedagogy from the Universidade Estadual Paulista Júlio de Mesquita Filho (1972), a Master's degree in Education from the Federal University of São Carlos (1978) and a doctoral degree in Education from the University of São Paulo (1987). He obtained his status of Full Professor of Philosophy of Education by the Federal University of Rio de Janeiro (UFRJ). He is currently an associate researcher at the Carlos Chagas Foundation; co-leader of the research group Rhetoric and Argumentation in Pedagogy; and full professor of the Post-Graduate Program in Education at the Estácio de Sá University. He has experience advising master's and doctoral students, as well as in undergraduate education with an emphasis in Philosophy of Education, working mainly with the following subjects: social representations, rhetoric, philosophy of education, epistemology and environmental education. He has published several books: *Epistemologia das Ciências da Educação* [Epistemology of the Sciences of Education] (2016), *Filosofia para as licenciaturas* [Philosophy for Licenciates] (2013), *Educação ou doutrinação ambiental? Análise retórica dos discursos de ambientalistas latino-americanos* [Education or environmental docttrination? Rhetorical analysis of the discourse of Latin-American environmentalists] (2013), *Doutrinas pedagógicas, máquinas produtoras de litígios* [Pedagogical doctrines, litigation production machines] (2008), among others. [tmazzotti@mac.com](mailto:tmazzotti@mac.com)